

nite town of Cluviae. This was the birthplace of Helvidius Priscus.<sup>29</sup> The younger Priscus is reported by Suetonius<sup>30</sup> to have been executed by Domitian for ridiculing the emperor's divorce in his farcical *Paris and Oenone*. This would connect with the tradition that Juvenal incurred the wrath of Paris, who was involved in the fall of Domitia.

If MacKay is right, should we read *Cluvianus* for *Cluuienus*? The manuscripts may have the wrong form, though there seem to be no significant variants, and *Cluuienus* would be the *lectio difficilior*. *Cluuienus* might indicate that Juvenal was exercising some little caution, though this would have been superfluous after Domitian's death, and it would in any case have been a very transparent guise. Elsewhere,<sup>31</sup> Juvenal does name the elder Helvidius Priscus (along with Thrasea); it is hard to decide if this spoils the interpretation of MacKay.

One can only be subjective about literary matters. I now<sup>32</sup> think that the context of Juvenal's allusion does not call for a mocking anticlimactic reference to a bad poet. *Cluuienus* can be a sympathetic reference. If so, MacKay is probably right.<sup>33</sup> If one retains the traditional implication, we are probably left with a poetaster under his own name, rather than one thinly veiled under a cover.

UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY

BARRY BALDWIN

<sup>29</sup>Tacitus *Hist.* 4.5.

<sup>30</sup>*Domitian* 10.4.

<sup>31</sup>*Sat.* 5.36.

<sup>32</sup>Thus modifying the view taken in my above-mentioned article.

<sup>33</sup>He is most recently supported by K. H. Waters, "Juvenal and the reign of Trajan," *Antichthon* 4 (1970) 62f. (see in particular p. 68, n. 23).



Presenting an Outstanding Library of

## TALKING BOOKS

for all ages

FREE—New catalog with complete listings of Audio Book cassettes, record albums & reels, including childrens, literary classics and religious. Contact:

**Audio Book**  
COMPANY

Dept. C-W, 301 Pasadena Avenue  
South Pasadena, Cal. 91030 (213) 799-0666

Dealer & Salesmen Inquiries Invited

## REVIEWS

Walter Donlan and Robert D. Sider

HERMANN HARRAUER. *A Bibliography to the Corpus Tibullianum*. (Bibliography to the Augustan Poetry, 1.) Hildesheim: Verlag Dr. H. A. Gerstenberg, 1971. Pp. 90. DM 32.

In this most recent bibliography of the *Corpus Tibullianum*, Harrauer attempts to offer in English a complete list of the literature written since 1900, with references to the important literature appearing before 1900 — a list of 1,128 items catalogued under twenty-one headings and followed by three indices — an *index locorum*, an *index rerum et nominum*, and an *index auctorum*.

Regarding the form of each bibliographical entry (referred to in this review by its number on Harrauer's list), the author's name appears in bold print, preceded at somewhat irregular intervals by the date of publication for the purpose of easier reference, and the remaining parts of the entry appear in indented form, followed by a list of reviews pertaining to that particular entry. While this format affords quick access to a writer and his reviewers, misspelled words and incomplete identifications occasionally detract from the appearance of the text: (78) *Gournement for Government*; (166) *Solmens for Solmsen*; (473) 1886 for 1866; (424) vols. not specified; (746) *progr.* not specified; (881) pp. not specified. In a more serious vein, Harrauer does not criticize or at least summarize the content of each entry — a procedure followed by A. Cartault in his *A propos du Corpus Tibullianum* (Paris 1906), a critical bibliography of the literature written from 1577 to the end of the nineteenth century, and a procedure which could have enabled Harrauer to produce a truly attractive bibliography of the *Corpus Tibullianum* for the twentieth century, a work updating and complementing the great contribution of his predecessor.

By listing the titles chronologically within each of the twenty-one categories, Harrauer permits his readers to observe the development of interest in a particular aspect of Tibullus's poetry, but the strict adherence to chronology seems to result in a minor exaggeration of the number of individual work actually produced, more specifically, when two editions or two parts of a single work appear as separate entries rather than as a single entry: Wright (80 and 120); Luck (90 and 121a); Riposati (157 and 179); Lenz (372 and 376); Harrauer (716 and 763); Karsten (748 and 749). By distributing the titles over the twenty-one categories, Harrauer provides a useful series of miniature bibliographies — including a particularly valuable bibliography of literature on the individual elegies of the first two books of the *Corpus Tibullianum* (VIII) — but the chapter on monograph (III) seems somewhat amorphous since it contains titles which really belong in other chapters of the bibliography: Cartault (141) deserves mention in the section on surveys (I); Schuster (146) and Wimmel (178) warrant inclusion in the section on structure (XII).

Concerning the completeness of the list, the bibliography seems very inclusive for the literature appearing since 1900 and somewhat selective for the literature appearing before 1900 — in accordance with Harrauer's stated goal. Still, in considering the important literature written before 1900, one perhaps misses mention of two significant articles — M. Haupt, "Über Joseph Scaliger und die von Haase vorgeschlagene Umstellung Tibullischer Verseihen," in *Opuscula* vol. 3 (Leipzig 1876), in which the author posits a lacuna before 1.10.51-52 (a proposal now accepted by most critics), and K. Lachmann, Review of L. Dissen, *Albi Tibulli carmina*, in *Kleinere Schriften zur Deutschen Philologie* vol. 2 (Berlin 1876), in which the author discusses at length Dissen's edition of Tibullus (the monumental text-commentary of the nineteenth century). Furthermore, in considering the literature written since 1900, one feels the need for references to two works containing short but detailed bibliographies of the *Corpus Tibullianum* — N. Herescu, *Bibliographie de la littérature latine* (Paris 1943), and K. Büchner, *Lateinische Literatur und Sprache in der Forschung seit 1937* (Bern 1951) — and references to several recent contributions in the area of critical analysis — J. Bell, "Elegiac Poetry," in J. Higginbotham, ed., *Greek and Latin Literature* (London 1969), and G. Williams, *The Nature of Roman Poetry* (Oxford 1970).

Despite certain shortcomings, Harrauer succeeds in providing his readers with a handy one-volume bibliography of the *Corpus Tibullianum* (including a number of titles not yet recorded in *L'Année Philologique*) - a publication clearly aimed at an English-speaking audience and apparently designed to herald the coming of a series of bibliographies on the Augustan poets.

UNIVERSITY OF HAWAII

ROBERT J. BALL

ROBERT COMBÈS (ed., tr.). Cicéron. Laelius de Amicitia. (Collection des Universités de France publiée sous le patronage de l'Association Guillaume Budé.) Paris: Société d'Édition "Les Belles Lettres," 1971. Pp. lxxviii, 68 (2-62: double). No price listed.

Robert Combès, who published a long study of the title *imperator* in 1966, has now edited and translated the Budé *De Amicitia*. The volume follows the familiar format of the series. A slight but helpful innovation is to be found in the apparatus criticus, where the notes have been broken up into short paragraphs that correspond to the numbered paragraphs of the text; each of these short paragraphs is preceded by a list of the manuscript sources cited. This arrangement prevents some possible confusion, as Combès makes use of eight fragmentary or incomplete manuscripts. In the book as a whole, however, no claims are made for innovations or advances, and there do not seem to be any.

One puzzling fault involves the dates assigned to three manuscripts (p56) in the *Conspectus Siglorum*. They are not the dates given in Combès' discussion of manuscripts in his introduction; it is as if the introduction and *conspectus* had been allowed independence of opinion by a tolerant editor. Combès' discussion of the manuscripts offers nothing new and seems to depend heavily on Laurand's 1928 edition. He has verified published collations from photographs. His apparatus includes rather elaborate reporting of alternate spellings and word orders that are of no apparent importance. The material in his introduction is comprehensive, although, again, no new departures are evident. Structural difficulties in the *Laelius* (particularly in the dialogue's opening), as pointed out by Ruch and Buechner, do not appear serious to Combès, who argues that parallels to the alleged difficulties occur elsewhere in Cicero's writings. Section IIB of the introduction, an analysis of the plan and composition, has been carefully done and is useful. Section IIC, dealing with style, is brief and perfunctory. Concerning the translation I would only make the very general observations that it is frequently less sharp and pointed than the Latin, and that Combès has taken some care throughout to make the shape and length of his sentences match those of Cicero; the latter fact may prove helpful to students. This is a thorough and good job of putting material together, although it will not be consulted for fresh points of view on the *Laelius*.

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

H. G. EDINGER

HANS-PETER BÜTLER. Die geistige Welt des jüngeren Plinius. Studien zur Thematik seiner Briefe. (Bibliothek der klassischen Altertumswissenschaften. Neue Folge, 2. Reihe, 38.) Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag, 1970. Pp. 159. DM 26 (paper); DM 32 (cloth).

In eleven chapters the author has investigated the realm of ideas in Pliny's correspondence and his *actio gratiarum*. The originality in approach is the analysis of these ideas and the discussion of appropriate passages. Samples: 4. "The conflict between *otium* and *negotium*;" 5. "The moral standard;" 8. "Friendship (Freundesliebe) and sympathy for younger men." This is a study in the social rather than in the intellectual world of Pliny. The treatment of ideas is bland, more than Pliny's text warrants, where often genuine vigor of thought lies close to the surface of these highly polished epistolary essays. Our

Flavian *novus homo* did not prosecute and defend successfully in the senate and in the centumviral court, and carry out onerous official duties without real dynamic force.

The monograph was presented in the summer of 1967 as a dissertation at the University of Zürich. It has the qualities of an acceptable dissertation and demonstrates familiarity with the works of the author. The notes cite the extensive bibliography on Pliny, at times without selectivity. Throughout Pliny is treated as he should be - with sympathy and understanding and without complaint that he is not a literary figure of the first rank.

Within the limits set by the author the treatment is full. However I miss some further consideration of the prosopographical and historical data which have concerned recent students of this era. Publication as a monograph raises the question whether the system of publication by microfilm may not be superior.

These chapters could be quite useful for a German student reading Pliny for the first time in the Gymnasium or University. Some chapters, if in English, would be good collateral reading for classes. However Mlle. Guillemin's volume (*Pline et la vie littéraire de son temps*, Paris 1929), especially pages 89-99 ("L'anticicéronisme"), or the brilliant article by Mrs. Radice, "A Fresh Approach to Pliny's Letters" in *Greece and Rome* 9 (1962) 160-169, would be better. Indeed more advanced students should go to Sir Roger Mynors' recent volumes in the *bibliotheca oxoniensis*, with a side-glance at the monumental commentary of Sherwin-White. Those whose Latin is less fluent will profit more by the highly literate translations of Mrs. Radice.

UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA

WILLIAM C. McDERMOTT

HAROLD C. GOTOFF. The Transmission of the Text of Lucan in the Ninth Century. (Loeb Classical Monographs.) Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1971. Pp. xii, 209. \$8.50.

"Five complete manuscripts of Lucan written in the first hundred years of the Carolingian awakening have survived the centuries to be discovered and preserved by modern scholars. So closely interrelated are these manuscripts, however, so redundant is their evidence, that, of the five, two are disused and a third nowhere fully reported by editors. Yet, a closer examination reveals that each of these five is a source of independent information, stored in some cases in the text, in some cases between the lines and in the margins. Furthermore, when the precise relationships among the five are defined and understood, it is possible to gain a clearer picture of the way texts were copied and corrected in the ninth century." So writes Harold C. Gotoff in his introduction of this important new contribution to Lucanian scholarship. Following his introduction, he describes the manuscripts and discusses the assessment of them by modern editors, expressing the opinion that Housman's scorn of Hosius' preference for manuscript M blinded Housman to much of M's real value. Gotoff then examines each of the manuscripts in detail and concludes that all are important and do not deserve to be overlooked. The book contains a diagram of the manuscript tradition of Lucan in the ninth century and ends with nine appendices furnishing readings in various manuscripts, the added leaves in one, the scholia in another, and the relationship of three of them to each other.

It is ironic that a book discussing the contaminated tradition of manuscripts of Lucan should itself contain typographical errors, but some do occur: *epithet* for *epitaph* (p. 20), *usato* for *uasto* (p. 45), *volent* for *uolent* (p. 52), *pumceus* for *punicus* (p. 74), to cite a few. Although most of the errors will probably be caught by the careful reader, still they are disconcerting. The last one mentioned (*pumceus* for *punicus*) is particularly unfortunate since it repeats a manuscript error that the author is trying to correct and, thus, obscures his point.

In spite of this, the book is a good one and makes a valuable contribution to the study and the editing of Lucan. Admittedly, such a work will have a

## STUDIES IN FIFTH-CENTURY THOUGHT AND LITERATURE

Edited by ADAM PARRY  
(Yale Classical Studies 22)

This volume contains thirteen articles covering a wide range of topics in Athenian intellectual history, drawing on the methods of various other disciplines to provoke a reconsideration of outstanding problems and controversies in classical studies. \$13.50

## POSIDONIUS

Volume 1: The Fragments  
Edited by L. EDELSTEIN and I. G. KIDD  
(Cambridge Classical Texts and Commentaries 13)

The first full and reliable edition of the surviving attested fragments of Posidonius. The late Professor Edelstein began to collect this material; I. G. Kidd completed and edited the work and supplied the introduction and the comprehensive indexes. Volume 2 will contain a full commentary. \$35.00

## EPICURUS

An Introduction  
J. M. RIST

A systematic survey of Epicurean thought and scholarship in which Professor Rist deals with each of Epicurus's main doctrines and interests, presenting the arguments and theories as simply and directly as possible. All Greek in the text is translated and specialized problems in interpretation are discussed in appendixes. \$12.50

Also by Professor Rist:

Plotinus: The Road to Reality \$16.50  
Stoic Philosophy \$11.50

## STUDIES IN THE LANGUAGE OF HOMER

Second Edition  
G. P. SHIPP  
(Cambridge Classical Studies)

In this edition Professor Shipp widens the scope of his work to examine the *Odyssey* as well as the *Iliad*, and extends its detail to include syntax as well as grammatical forms. \$23.50

Now available as Cambridge Paperbacks:

PLATO'S PHAEDO  
PLATO'S PHILEBUS  
PLATO'S PHAEDRUS

Edited and translated by R. HACKFORTH Each \$2.75



**Cambridge University Press**

32 East 57th Street, New York, N.Y. 10022

# THE CLASSICAL WORLD

OCTOBER 1972

VOL. 66, No. 2

WHOLE No. 1361

## CONTENTS

<i>Kenneth Quinn, Viktor Pöschl, Martin D. Snyder, Jerry Clack: Vergil Engaged</i>	65
CAAS: Executive Committee, 1972-1973	76
<i>George Eckel Duckworth 1903-1972</i>	77
<i>Evelyn H. Clift: Minutes of the Spring Meeting</i>	80
<i>George Sanderlin: Vergil's Protection of Aeneas in Aeneid II</i>	82
<i>Sister Johanna Glazewski: The Function of Vergil's Funeral Games</i>	85
<i>David H. Porter: A Modicum of Greek in the In-Translation Course</i>	97
<i>Barry Baldwin: Three Characters in Juvenal</i>	101
Reviews	105
Notes and News	123
Book Received	126



Published by the Classical Association of the Atlantic States, Inc.